

APPROVED IN OPEN BOARD MEETING, JANUARY 18, 2005

**THE SCHOOL BOARD OF BROWARD COUNTY, FLORIDA
OFFICE OF THE SUPERINTENDENT**

**December 16, 2004
Thursday, 11:00 a.m.**

MINUTES OF SPECIAL MEETING

The School Board of Broward County, Florida, met in special session at 11:15 a.m., Thursday, December 16, 2004, in the Board Room of the Kathleen C. Wright Administrative Center, 600 Southeast Third Avenue, Fort Lauderdale, Florida. Present were Chair Stephanie Arma Kraft, Esq.; Vice Chair Benjamin J. Williams; Members Carole L. Andrews, Robin Bartleman, Darla L. Carter, Maureen S. Dinnen, Beverly A. Gallagher, Dr. Robert D. Parks, Marty Rubinstein; Superintendent Franklin L. Till, Jr.; and Marylin Batista-McNamara, Esq., Robert P. Vignola, Esq.

Call to Order The call to order was followed by the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag of the United States of America.

Close Agenda Upon motion by Mr. Rubinstein, seconded by Mrs. Andrews and carried, the Agenda was approved and declared closed.

1. Selection of CM at-Risk Contractor – South Plantation High School, Project No. 2351-22-02 ; Norcrest Elementary School, Project No. 0561-24-01 - Request for Qualifications (RFQ)
(Selected and Awarded Contract –South Plantation High School to James A. Cummings, Inc.)
(Selected and Awarded Contract – Norcrest Elementary School to Stiles Construction Co., Inc.)

Motion was made by Mr. Rubinstein, seconded by Ms. Carter and carried, to approve to select the CM at-Risk contract(s) for South Plantation High School, Project No. 2351-22-02 and Norcrest Elementary School, Project No. 0561-24-01.

Mrs. Kraft announced that the purpose of the meeting is to interview finalists and award the CM At-Risk contracts for the South Plantation High School and Norcrest Elementary School projects.

Mr. Michael Garretson, Deputy Superintendent, Facilities and Construction Management, discussed the comparison between the CM at-Risk and Design/Build construction delivery methods. Mr. Garretson informed the Board that Young Song and Associates is the architectural firm that will develop plans for both projects.

Mr. Tom Casner, Vice-President, Young Song and Associates, presented the plans for both projects and discussed the scope of the projects.

Mr. Garretson reported that for the Norcrest Elementary project, the Consultants Review Committee (CRC) ranked James A. Cummings, Inc. for first place, and tied for second place Stiles Construction, Inc. and W.G. Mills. For South Plantation High School, the CRC ranked a tie score of first place to all four proposers. Mr. Garretson stated that the back-up information provided to the Board includes staff comments and recommendations, contractor pre-qualification information, Supplier Diversity & Outreach Program office with award recommendations for scoring, a memorandum from the School Board Attorney regarding pre-qualifications, CRC vote summary, summary of contractors' ratings by district project managers and inspectors, projects by contractor listing, and CRC expenditure report. In addition, two sets of score sheets have been included for Plantation High School and Norcrest Elementary School.

Ms. Gallagher voiced concern over the uncertainty of the quality of the work of a new contractor and how it would reflect in the scoring process.

Mr. Garretson responded that the firms that have not worked previously for the district have substantial experience in multiple districts throughout the state of Florida. Mr. Garretson stated that a settlement with the district resulted in a requirement to consider the volume of work of a firm.

Mr. Vignola advised that a settlement arose because the school district's governing laws and the State Board of Education regulations have required the volume of work as one of the minimum elements. Mr. Vignola stated that the Board has the liberty to remove the element. Mr. Vignola further stated that the Board can consider the dollar value and volume of work previously awarded to the Design/Build firm with the objective of affecting equitable distribution of contracts among qualified firms, provided such distribution does not violate the principal of selection of the most highly qualified firm.

Responding to Mrs. Bartleman's inquiry, Mr. Vignola stated that the scoring is based on what is set forth in the bid documents. He stated that the volume of work should be factored in the scoring as the other elements are reviewed.

Mr. Garretson explained the procedure to be followed in the hearing.

Responding to Ms. Carter's inquiry, Mr. Vignola stated that the Supplier Diversity & Outreach Program staff has reviewed the status that each of the vendors has received in order to derive the points that they have assigned.

Ms. Carter voiced concern that the review by the Supplier Diversity & Outreach Program staff is not contained in the documents provided to the Board.

Mr. Garretson stated that the Audit Department audits each project to ensure that the requirements have been met. He stated that an annual report from the Supplier Diversity & Outreach Program office will be submitted which outlines the audits of all projects in construction and whether the Supplier Diversity & Outreach Program goals have been met.

The following firms made their presentations:

James A. Cummings, Inc.	Ray de la Feuilliez, Eric Squilla, Rick Derrer
Stiles Construction Co., Inc.	David Lowery, Paul Curtis
Centex-Rooney Construction Co., Inc.	Tim Anderson, Al Petrangeli, Mark Finucane, Lovett Gaither, Chris Long, Kent Long, Kevin Stubbs
Turner Construction Company	Ron Melendez, Jay Fraser, Ed Vivas, Mike Gory, Wanda Wimberly, Ron Patten, Steven Soso
W. G. Mills, Inc.	Tim Hensey, Jay Hoffman, Adam Young, Jeff Easterday, Sasha Babanja,

Following all presentations and Board discussion, Mrs. Kraft announced that the Board will pause momentarily to tally their scores, using the numbers that are reflected in the score sheet.

Advising the Board Members to sign their score sheets, Mr. Vignola stated that if in the event the highest scored proposer is a tie-vote, identification must be made as to which of the tied proposers is the first choice, and write the name of the vendor next to the signature line. Mr. Vignola stated that ranking must occur according to the RFP, first, second, third and fourth rank.

Following the tallying of scores, Mrs. Kraft announced that the ranked scores were cast for Norcrest Elementary School project, as shown below:

Stiles Construction Co., Inc.	4
James A. Cummings, Inc.	3
W.G. Mills	2

Mrs. Kraft announced that the ranked scores were cast for the South Plantation High School project, as shown below:

James A. Cummings, Inc.	4
Centex-Rooney Construction Co., Inc.	3
Stiles Construction Co., Inc.	2
Turner Construction Co., Inc.	0

Motion to Approve (Carried)

Motion was made by Mrs. Andrews, seconded by Mr. Rubinstein and carried, to approve the Board's rankings to select James A. Cummings, Inc. for the South Plantation High School project, and to direct that contract negotiations be conducted in accordance with the RFP. Ms. Gallagher voted "no." (8-1 vote)

Motion to Approve (Carried)

Motion was made by Mr. Rubinstein, seconded by Mrs. Andrews and carried, to approve the Board's rankings to select Stiles Construction Co. Inc. for the Norcrest Elementary School project, and to direct that contract negotiations be conducted in accordance with the RFP.

Motion to Adjourn (Carried)

Motion was made by Mr. Rubinstein, seconded by Mrs. Andrews and carried, to adjourn the proceedings.

Adjournment This meeting was adjourned at 2:50 p.m.

RT