



RFP #:	<u>19-097E</u>	Tentative Board Meeting Date*:	<u>MARCH 2019</u>
RFP Title:	<u>WAN Fiber Options</u>	# Notified:	<u>518</u> # Downloaded: <u>21</u>
		# of Responses Rec'd:	<u>6</u> # of "No Bids": <u>0</u>
For:	<u>INFORMATION & TECHNOLOGY DEPARTMENT</u>	RFP Opening Date :	<u>11/13/18</u>
	(School/Department)		
Fund:	<u>I & T'S OPERATING BUDGET</u>	Advertised Date:	<u>9/24/18</u>

POSTING OF RFP RECOMMENDATION/TABULATION: RFP Recommendations and Tabulations will be posted in the Procurement & Warehousing Services and www.Demandstar.com @ **3:00 pm** and will remain posted for 72 hours. Any person who is adversely affected by the decision or intended decision shall file a notice of protest, in writing, within 72 hours after the posting of the notice of decision or intended decision. The formal written protest shall be filed within ten (10) days after the date the notice of protest is filed. Failure to file a notice of protest or failure to file a formal written protest shall constitute a waiver of proceedings under this chapter. Section 120.57(3)(b), Florida Statutes, states that "The formal written protest shall state with particularity the facts and law upon which the protest is based." Saturdays, Sundays, state holidays and days during which the District is closed shall be excluded in the computation of the 72-hour time period provided. Filings shall be at the office of the Director of Procurement & Warehousing Services, 7720 West Oakland Park Boulevard, Suite 323, Sunrise, Florida 33351. Any person who files an action protesting an intended decision shall post with the School Board, at the time of filing the formal written protest, a bond, payable to The School Board of Broward County, Florida, (SBBC), in an amount equal to one percent (1%) of the estimated value of the contract. Failure to post the bond required by SBBC Policy 3320, Part VIII, Purchasing Policies, Section N, within the time allowed for filing a bond shall constitute a waiver of the right to protest.

(* The Cone of Silence, as stated in the ITB / RFP / RFQ / HARD BID, is in effect until it is approved by SBBC. The Board meeting date stated above is tentative. Confirm with the Purchasing Agent of record for the actual date the Cone of Silence has concluded.

RECOMMENDATION TABULATION

PROPOSALS WERE EVALUATED BY THE FOLLOWING RFP EVALUATION COMMITTEE MEMBERS:
 DIANE SHAPIRO – INFORMATION & TECHNOLOGY DEPARTMENT – SR. TELECOM ANALYST
 JASON GREENBERG – INFORMATION & TECHNOLOGY DEPARTMENT – SYSTEM ANALYST
 RICK REYNOLDS – BECON (BROWARD EDUCATION COMMUNICATIONS NETWORK) – DIRECTOR
 RUSSELL KAUFMAN – MIAMI DADE COLLEGE – CAMPUS CHIEF INFORMATION OFFICER
 TERESA MACRI – INFORMATION & TECHNOLOGY DEPARTMENT – DIRECTOR, IT SECURITY

NETWORK DESIGN WAS EVALUATED BY THE FOLLOWING EXPERT PANEL:
 ARTEM ASTAFIEV – INFORMATION & TECHNOLOGY DEPARTMENT – SYSTEMS ANALYST
 CHUCK GRIFFIN – BECON (BROWARD EDUCATION COMMUNICATIONS NETWORK) – ENGINEERING MANAGER
 DANIEL MIRONES – INFORMATION & TECHNOLOGY DEPARTMENT – INFORMATION SECURITY MANAGER
 MICHAEL LUZADDER – INFORMATION & TECHNOLOGY DEPARTMENT – SYSTEMS ANALYST III
 WILLIAM LEONARD – ATLANTIC TECHNICAL HIGH SCHOOL & TECHNICAL COLLEGE – MICROTECH SPEC

S/M/WBE ADVISOR – ANNE-MARIE RICHARDS

IN ACCORDANCE WITH SECTION 5.1. EVALUATION OF PROPOSALS AND THE EVALUATION COMMITTEE, IT IS RECOMMENDED THAT THE FOLLOWING PROPOSER(S) BE RECOMMENDED FOR APPROVAL BY THE SCHOOL BOARD:

- ❖ ENA SERVICES, LLC - OPTION 1
- ❖ ENA SERVICES, LLC - OPTION 2
- ❖ ENA SERVICES, LLC - OPTION 3

CONTRACT PERIOD: JULY 1, 2019 THROUGH JUNE 30, 2029 WITH AN OPTION FOR THREE (3) ADDITIONAL FIVE (5) YEAR RENEWAL PERIODS.

By:  Date: December 4, 2019
 (Purchasing Agent)

The School Board of Broward County, Florida, prohibits any policy or procedure which results in discrimination on the basis of age, color, disability, gender expression, national origin, marital status, race, religion, sex or sexual orientation. Individuals who wish to file a discrimination complaint, may call the Executive Director, Benefits & EEO Compliance at 754-321-2150 or Teletype Machine (TTY) at 754-321-2158.

Individuals with disabilities requesting accommodations under the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) may call the Equal Educational Opportunities (EEO) at 754-321-2150 or Teletype Machine (TTY) at 754-321-2158.



19-097E
BID REJECTION

REJECT BID FROM COMCAST BUSINESS COMMUNICATIONS, LLC

THE PROPOSER REFUSED TO ACCEPT SBBC'S TERMS AND CONDITIONS AND ADDED A CONDITION TO THE REQUIRED RESPONSE FORM STATING: "THE COMCAST ENTERPRISE MASTER SERVICES AGREEMENT, ATTACHED TO THE RESPONSE SHALL GOVERN ANY AGREEMENT FOR SERVICES BETWEEN THE PARTIES. NO PART OF THE RFP OR RESPONSE SHALL BE DEEMED A CONTRACTUAL TERM UNLESS INCLUDED IN SAID AGREEMENT." THE PROVISIONS IN THE REFERENCED COMCAST ENTERPRISE MASTER SERVICES AGREEMENT ARE IN CONFLICT WITH THE RFP INCLUDING SECTION 4.2 AND REQUIRE THE REJECTION OF ITS PROPOSAL.

AS STATED IN SECTION 1:

"PROPOSER AGREES TO **UNCONDITIONAL ACCEPTANCE** OF THE CONTENTS OF ALL PAGES IN THIS RFP, AND ALL APPENDICES, AND THE CONTENTS OF ANY ADDENDA RELEASED HERETO; **PROPOSER AGREES TO BE BOUND TO ANY AND ALL SPECIFICATIONS, TERMS AND CONDITIONS CONTAINED IN THE RFP**, AND ANY RELEASED ADDENDEA AND UNDERSTAND THAT THE FOLLOWING ARE REQUIREMENTS OF THIS RFP AND **FAILURE TO COMPLY WILL RESULT IN DISQUALIFICATION OF PROPOSAL SUBMITTED.**"

The School Board of Broward County, Florida, prohibits any policy or procedure which results in discrimination on the basis of age, color, disability, gender expression, national origin, marital status, race, religion, sex or sexual orientation. Individuals who wish to file a discrimination complaint, may call the Executive Director, Benefits & EEO Compliance at 754-321-2150 or Teletype Machine (TTY) at 754-321-2158.

Individuals with disabilities requesting accommodations under the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) may call the Equal Educational Opportunities (EEO) at 754-321-2150 or Teletype Machine (TTY) at 754-321-2158.



FINAL SCORE TABULATION SHEET

Bid No:	19-097E	
Title of Bid:	WAN Fiber Options	
Purchasing Agent Name:	Harmoni Clealand	
Bid Opening Date:	November 13, 2018	
Evaluation Meeting:	November 28, 2018	
Proposer's Name	Total Score	Recommended for Award
Option 1		
AT & T (Option 1)	71.2	
ENA (Option 1)	92.2	✓
WANRack (Option 1)	75.9	
Zayo (Option 1)	64.5	
Option 2		
ENA (Option 2)	92.1	✓
Zayo (Option 2)	67.1	
Option 3		
ENA (Option 3)	92.2	✓
Uniti (Option 3)	53.2	

SCORE DETAILS

Bid No:	19-097E					
Title of Bid:	WAN Fiber Options					
Evaluators	Diane	Jason	Rick	Russell	Teresa	Average Points
Qualifications & Experience - Maximum Points: 20						
AT & T (Option 1)	20.0	18.0	20.0	18.0	20.0	19.2
ENA (Option 1)	19.0	20.0	20.0	15.0	19.0	18.6
ENA (Option 2)	19.0	19.5	20.0	15.0	19.0	18.5
ENA (Option 3)	19.0	20.0	20.0	15.0	19.0	18.6
Uniti (Option 3)	14.0	7.0	11.5	17.0	8.5	11.6
WANRack (Option 1)	15.0	11.0	16.0	14.0	10.0	13.2
Zayo (Option 1)	15.0	14.0	20.0	17.0	18.0	16.8
Zayo (Option 2)	15.0	14.0	20.0	17.0	18.0	16.8
Scope of Work - Maximum Points: 10						
AT & T (Option 1)	10.0	9.0	10.0	9.0	8.0	9.2
ENA (Option 1)	10.0	10.0	9.5	7.0	8.5	9.0
ENA (Option 2)	10.0	10.0	9.5	7.0	8.5	9.0
ENA (Option 3)	10.0	10.0	9.5	7.0	8.5	9.0
Uniti (Option 3)	9.0	9.0	10.0	8.0	7.5	8.7
WANRack (Option 1)	9.0	8.0	10.0	7.0	7.0	8.2
Zayo (Option 1)	9.0	10.0	10.0	8.0	8.5	9.1
Zayo (Option 2)	9.0	10.0	10.0	8.0	8.5	9.1
Presentation - Maximum Points: 5						
AT & T (Option 1)						
ENA (Option 1)						
ENA (Option 2)						
ENA (Option 3)						
Uniti (Option 3)						
WANRack (Option 1)						
Zayo (Option 1)						
Zayo (Option 2)						
Network Design - Maximum Points: 25						
AT & T (Option 1)	<i>Per RFP, this section scored by Experts. See Network Design Evaluation Score Worksheet for more details.</i>					12.4
ENA (Option 1)						24.6
ENA (Option 2)						24.6
ENA (Option 3)						24.6
Uniti (Option 3)						18.4
WANRack (Option 1)						21.4
Zayo (Option 1)						19.6
Zayo (Option 2)						19.6
Cost of Services - Maximum Points: 30						
AT & T (Option 1)	<i>Per RFP, this section scored by PWS. See PWS Evaluation Score Worksheet for more details.</i>					20
ENA (Option 1)						30
ENA (Option 2)						30
ENA (Option 3)						30
Uniti (Option 3)						14
WANRack (Option 1)						23
Zayo (Option 1)						19
Zayo (Option 2)						22
S/M/WBE - Maximum Points: 10						
AT & T (Option 1)	<i>Per RFP, this section scored by Supplier Diversity Dept (SDOP). See PWS Evaluation Score Worksheet for more details.</i>					10
ENA (Option 1)						10
ENA (Option 2)						10
ENA (Option 3)						10
Uniti (Option 3)						0
WANRack (Option 1)						10
Zayo (Option 1)						0
Zayo (Option 2)						0
GRAND TOTAL - Maximum Points: 100						
AT & T (Option 1)	71.2					
ENA (Option 1)	92.2					
ENA (Option 2)	92.1					
ENA (Option 3)	92.2					
Uniti (Option 3)	53.2					
WANRack (Option 1)	75.9					
Zayo (Option 1)	64.5					
Zayo (Option 2)	67.1					

NETWORK DESIGN SCORE DETAILS

Bid No:	19-097E					
Title of Bid:	WAN Fiber Options					
Evaluators	Art Astafiev	Chuck Griffin	William Leonard	Michael Luzadder	Daniel Mirones	Average Points
4.4.4.1 (Maximum 6)						
AT&T (Option 1)	2	3	0	3	0	1.6
ENA (Option 1)	6	6	6	5	6	5.8
ENA (Option 2)	6	6	6	5	6	5.8
ENA (Option 3)	6	6	6	5	6	5.8
Uniti (Option 3)	3	3	4	2	5	3.4
WANRack (Option 1)	3	5	2	3	6	3.8
Zayo (Option 1)	4	5	5	3	5	4.4
Zayo (Option 2)	4	5	5	3	5	4.4
4.4.4.2 (Maximum 3)						
AT&T (Option 1)	2	3	3	2	0	2.0
ENA (Option 1)	3	3	3	3	3	3.0
ENA (Option 2)	3	3	3	3	3	3.0
ENA (Option 3)	3	3	3	3	3	3.0
Uniti (Option 3)	3	2	3	1	2	2.2
WANRack (Option 1)	3	3	3	3	3	3.0
Zayo (Option 1)	3	3	3	2	2	2.6
Zayo (Option 2)	3	3	3	2	2	2.6
4.4.4.3 (Maximum 4)						
AT&T (Option 1)	2	4	4	3	0	2.6
ENA (Option 1)	4	4	4	4	4	4.0
ENA (Option 2)	4	4	4	4	4	4.0
ENA (Option 3)	4	4	4	4	4	4.0
Uniti (Option 3)	3	3	4	3	3	3.2
WANRack (Option 1)	4	4	3	4	4	3.8
Zayo (Option 1)	3	4	4	3	3	3.4
Zayo (Option 2)	3	4	4	3	3	3.4
4.4.4.4 (Maximum 12)						
AT&T (Option 1)	6	5	7	7	6	6.2
ENA (Option 1)	12	12	12	12	11	11.8
ENA (Option 2)	12	12	12	12	11	11.8
ENA (Option 3)	12	12	12	12	11	11.8
Uniti (Option 3)	12	8	7	10	11	9.6
WANRack (Option 1)	12	10	9	12	11	10.8
Zayo (Option 1)	12	10	4	10	10	9.2
Zayo (Option 2)	12	10	4	10	10	9.2
Total Network Design Score (Maximum 25)						
AT&T (Option 1)	12	15	14	15	6	12.4
ENA (Option 1)	25	25	25	24	24	24.6
ENA (Option 2)	25	25	25	24	24	24.6
ENA (Option 3)	25	25	25	24	24	24.6
Uniti (Option 3)	21	16	18	16	21	18.4
WANRack (Option 1)	22	22	17	22	24	21.4
Zayo (Option 1)	22	22	16	18	20	19.6
Zayo (Option 2)	22	22	16	18	20	19.6

PWS EVALUATION SCORE WORKSHEET

Note: ALL Sections below scored by Procurement & Warehousing Services (PWS)

Bid No:	19-097E
Title of Bid:	WAN Fiber Options
Cost Scored by:	Harmoni Clealand
Cost Max Points:	30
S/M/WBE Scored by:	Anne-Marie Richards
S/M/W/BE Max Points:	10

From all Proposers, the LOWEST total cost is: \$31,709,496.00

Proposer's Name	S/M/WBE Evaluation Points	Proposer's Total Cost	Cost Evaluation Points
AT & T (Option 1)	10	\$ 46,575,623.40	20
ENA (Option 1)	10	\$ 31,709,496.00	30
WANRack (Option 1)	10	\$ 41,120,640.00	23
Zayo (Option 1)	0	\$ 50,088,014.40	19

From all Proposers, the LOWEST total cost is: \$31,680,000.00

Proposer's Name	S/M/WBE Evaluation Points	Proposer's Total Cost	Cost Evaluation Points
ENA (Option 2)	10	\$ 31,680,000.00	30
Zayo (Option 2)	0	\$ 44,033,999.56	22

From all Proposers, the LOWEST total cost is: \$29,092,000.00

Proposer's Name	S/M/WBE Evaluation Points	Proposer's Total Cost	Cost Evaluation Points
ENA (Option 3)	10	\$ 29,092,000.00	30
Uniti (Option 3)	0	\$ 60,334,560.00	14

*** From all Proposers, the LOWEST total cost is: \$19,588,000.08**

Proposer's Name	S/M/WBE Eval Points	Proposer's Total Cost	Cost Evaluation Points
ENA (Option 3)	10	\$ 19,588,000.08	30
Uniti (Option 3)	0	\$ 48,644,640.00	12

* The Excel Summary Pricing sheet released with the RFP for Vendor's to populate with their pricing, was missing the Category 1 Network Equipment Managed Service Monthly Fee column for the WAN IRU option. This pricing was calculated to include the missing column in the total. Below is a screen shot of the original Excel and the Excel with missing column.

Company Name: **Uniti Fiber LLC**

WAN Type	# of Sites	ONE-TIME COSTS		MONTHLY		Year 1 Total Cost	Years 2-10 Total Cost	10-Year Grand Total Cost <small>(Amounts below will be used to calculate points)</small>
		Non-Recurring	Recurring	Management Service				
OPTION 1 - WAN Lit								
Lit Fiber - 1 G Sites	23	\$0.00	\$0.00		\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	
Lit Fiber - 10 G Sites	170	\$0.00	\$0.00		\$0.00	\$0.00		
Lit Fiber - 20 G Sites	49	\$0.00	\$0.00		\$0.00	\$0.00		
Lit Fiber - 30 G Sites	17	\$0.00	\$0.00		\$0.00	\$0.00		
Lit Fiber - 40 G Sites	4	\$0.00	\$0.00		\$0.00	\$0.00		
Lit Fiber - 160 G Sites	1	\$0.00	\$0.00		\$0.00	\$0.00		
Lit Fiber Totals	264	\$0.00	\$0.00		\$0.00	\$0.00	NOTE: <small>Cost above reflects anticipated credit (Cell H13 from LIT tab).</small>	
OPTION 2 - WAN Dark								
Dark Fiber	264	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	
OPTION 3 - WAN Dark IRU								
Dark Fiber (IRU)	264	\$13,068,000.00	\$145,992.00	\$150,480.00	\$16,625,664.00	\$32,018,976.00	\$48,644,640.00	



Company Name: Unifi Fiber LLC

WAN Type	# of Sites	ONE-TIME COSTS	MONTHLY			Year 1 Total Cost	Years 2-10 Total Cost	10-Year Grand Total Cost <small>(Amounts below will be used to calculate points)</small>
		Non-Recurring	Recurring	Management Service	Category 1 Network Equipment Managed Service Monthly Fee			
OPTION 1 - WAN Lit								
Lit Fiber - 1 G Sites	23	\$0.00	\$0.00			\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00
Lit Fiber - 10 G Sites	170	\$0.00	\$0.00			\$0.00	\$0.00	
Lit Fiber - 20 G Sites	49	\$0.00	\$0.00			\$0.00	\$0.00	
Lit Fiber - 30 G Sites	17	\$0.00	\$0.00			\$0.00	\$0.00	
Lit Fiber - 40 G Sites	4	\$0.00	\$0.00			\$0.00	\$0.00	
Lit Fiber - 160 G Sites	1	\$0.00	\$0.00			\$0.00	\$0.00	
Lit Fiber Totals	264	\$0.00	\$0.00			\$0.00	\$0.00	NOTE: <small>Cost above reflects anticipated credit (Cell H13 from LIT tab).</small>
OPTION 2 - WAN Dark								
Dark Fiber	264	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00	\$0.00
OPTION 3 - WAN Dark IRU								
Dark Fiber (IRU)	264	\$13,068,000.00	\$145,992.00	\$150,480.00	\$97,416.00	\$17,794,656.00	\$42,539,904.00	\$60,334,560.00