

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Recommendation to Approve Agreement FY20-149 – Tutormate and TeacherMate Literacy Support Programs

Introduction

Responsible: Procurement & Warehousing (PWS)

This request is to approve the agreement between Innovations for Learning, Inc., and The School Board of Broward County, Florida (SBBC), commencing on January 1, 2020 through June 1, 2021 for FY20-149 – Tutormate and TeacherMate Literacy Support Programs. Funds are made available through the Title I Grant.

The previous agreement was approved by the School Board on July 28, 2015, commencing on August 1, 2015, and concluding on July 30, 2016, or when complete funding was exhausted. This Agreement purchased the TutorMate district partnership fee, two (2) full-time Teacher Ambassadors, and site-based resources for participating Innovations for Learning schools.

The total spending authority being requested for the new agreement is \$300,000.

Tutormate Supplemental Literacy Program: Goods/Services Description

Responsible: Early Learning Language Acquisition (ELLA)

This agreement will cover the District Partnership Fee for the Tutormate online tutoring portal, District Partnership Fee for the TeacherMate classroom supplemental portal, site-based resources for participating Innovations for Learning Schools, and staff to support program implementation:

- National Director of District Partnerships and Services: Hire, train, support, develop, and provide on-going management of assigned staff.
- Local Program Ambassador: Installs TutorMate equipment, conducts initial teacher overview, assists with the launch, and coordinates end-of-year meet and greets for tutors to meet their students.
- Six (6) Early Literacy Interventionists: Provide sixty (60) minutes of 1:1 tutor conferencing each day for kindergarten classrooms (and some first grade) at targeted schools using the TeacherMate instructional model and tools to focus on foundational skills progressions.

Both the TutorMate and TeacherMate programs are unique in the format, delivery, technique, and services provided.

Broward County Public Schools (BCPS) first partnered with Innovations for Learning in 2013 with the initiation of the Tutormate Program. Through this online Tutoring portal, first-grade students are matched with a remote volunteer tutor for thirty (30) minutes a week. The tutor and student work together from the same computer screen and communicate through the phone (tutor) and headphones/microphone (student) as they support and review skills, play word games and read books. Games, skills, and book levels are all targeted to meet the student's specific needs and adapt to meet the reading development of the child. At the end of the year, tutors have the opportunity to meet their students during a "reveal party" at the school site, where all children receive a book and literacy activities to support summer reading. Current Broward County partners include Expedia, ATT, Broward College, JM Family, Advanced Roofing, Children's Services Council, Publix, Lauderhill Fire Department, City of Deerfield Beach, Fidelity, Lockheed Martin, JP Morgan Chase, and Northern Trust supporting twenty-seven (27) classrooms at eight (8) BCPS Schools: (Sunland Park Academy, North Fork Elementary, Deerfield Beach Elementary, Endeavour Primary Learning Center, Floranada Elementary, Park Ridge Elementary, Walker Elementary, and Thurgood Marshall Elementary). With this Agreement, the Tutormate service will be available for additional Title I schools throughout the District, along with support for recruiting volunteer tutors and hardware/resources at expansion school sites.

**Recommendation to Approve Agreement
FY20-149 – Tutormate and Teachermate Supplemental Literacy Programs
December 10, 2019 Board Agenda
Page 2**

In addition to Broward County, the Tutormate program is currently operating in thirty (30) large Urban School Districts across the United States, including Atlanta, Charlotte, Mecklenburg, New York City, Boston, Dallas, Houston, Long Beach, and Washington DC, along with several large cities in the United Kingdom.

Tutormate Supplemental Literacy Program: Impact and Research Studies

Research conducted through the National Literacy Trust and George Washington University (which included samples from BCPS) both showed statistically significant positive outcomes (reading achievement, reading skills acquisition, and reading enjoyment) for students participating in the program, along with positive feedback from teachers and volunteers.

Results from the 2019 National Literacy Trust research study across multiple districts reflected that:

- Children who participated in Tutormate increased on average by three-point two (3.2) reading levels [from two-point eight (2.8) to six-point zero (6.0)] with a phonics assessment score increase by an average of nine-point three (9.3) points over the same time period [from twenty-seven-point four (27.4) to thirty-six-point seven (36.7)].
- Children who participated in twenty-two (22) or more sessions throughout the year saw higher increases [three-point six (3.6) levels] in their reading level than those who participated in less than twenty-two (22) sessions [an average of three (3) levels]. The average reading level after participating in Tutormate was higher for children who participated in twenty-two (22) or more sessions than those who took part in less than twenty-two (22) sessions.
- Children participating in Tutormate who was reading within the two (2) lowest levels showed a statistically significant higher rate of progression in their reading levels compared to a control group of their peers. With Tutormate, students, on average, increased to reading at a level five (5), and the control group increased their reading to level three-point three (3.3) by the end of the year.

During the 2014-2015 school year, George Washington University's Graduate School of Education studied the impact of TutorMate in BCPS. Test score data showed that students in treatment classrooms improved from thirty-four point-five (34.5) percent at grade level reading at the beginning of the year to seventy-eight point-two (78.2) percent at the end of the year. In addition, results showed that the online tutoring component of TutorMate functioned as an important facet of the broader literacy instructional program with an increased number of students who started the year below grade level and finished at or above grade level.

Also, in 2014-2015, Epsilon Economics analyzed district test data of twelve (12) TutorMate district partners, including BCPS, derived from a randomized trial of students who were tutored online during the school year. Approximately six hundred (600) students were randomly placed in treatment and control groups, and the analysis showed that students who received at least sixteen (16) tutoring sessions made fifteen (15) percent more reading growth than the control group, nearly one (1) full reading level of improvement. T-tests conducted by Epsilon Economics confirmed a statistically significant impact on reading scores of the TutorMate program.

**Teachermate Supplemental Literacy Model (ELI Tutors): Goods/Services Description
Responsible: Early Learning Language Acquisition (ELLA)**

In addition to the TutorMate online portal, Innovations for Learning has expanded its services to include professional on-site tutors who serve as Early Literacy Interventionists (ELI) through the TeacherMate ELI model in kindergarten (and some first grade) classrooms at the targeted schools. These tutors, hired and

**Recommendation to Approve Agreement
 FY20-149 – Tutormate and Teachermate Supplemental Literacy Programs
 December 10, 2019 Board Agenda
 Page 3**

trained by Innovations for Learning, work alongside the teacher to provide direct Reading Foundational Skill support to individual students through daily conferencing and tutoring sessions. Reading Foundational Skills focuses on phonics/decoding strategies following the reading stages pathway of Stage 1-Letter Names, Stage 2-Initial Consonant Sounds, Stage 3-Short Vowel Sounds, Stage 4-Consonant Vowel Consonant (CVC) Words, and Stage 5-Consonant Vowel Consonant Silent E (CVC-E) Words.

The ELI TeacherMate model was implemented as part of a research study in one (1) BCPS (Endeavour Primary Learning Center) during the 2017-2018 school year and two (2) schools (Endeavour Primary Learning Center and Walker Elementary) in 2018-2019.

With this Agreement, the ELI TeacherMate Model will be expanded to support additional Title I schools and additional classrooms/grade levels at the originally targeted schools. The number of ELI Tutors and hours served daily is based on the need of the school (number of classrooms, students, grades served).

Early Literacy Interventionists Tutors (ELI Model)		
School	Number of Tutors	Hours Daily
Endeavour Primary Learning	2	7.5
Flamingo Elementary	1	5
Park Ridge Elementary	1	5
Sunland Park Academy	1	4
Thurgood Marshall Elementary	1	3
Walker Elementary	2	7
Total	8	31.5

Teachermate Supplemental Literacy Program: Impact and Research Studies:

In 2017-2018, Innovations for Learning joined with Curriculum Education Associations to initiate a longitudinal research study on the ELI tutoring program and expanded the study in 2018-2019 to two (2) schools in Broward County, two (2) schools located in a Southcentral school system, and one (1) in the Midwest. The initial results (year one (1) of the four (4) year study) with a randomized control trial showed significant positive results with the kindergarten students, the kindergarten students transitioning to first grade, and the overall teacher perspectives.

Randomized Control Trial (RCT) Involving Kindergarten Students:

- In the RCT, **students that received ELI support (treatment) outperformed control students (no ELI support)** on an assessment of emergent reading proficiency. On average, treatment students in four (4) schools [twenty-three (23) classrooms] where the study was conducted achieved a higher Innovations for Learning (IFL) Reading Foundation Stage (RFS) by the end of kindergarten than control students. Students that achieve RFS 4 have mastered letter names, initial consonant sounds, and overcome short-vowel confusion.
- **Children that took part in the ELI program demonstrated a statistically significant higher rate of progression in their reading compared to students that did not.** On average, treatment students reached an IFL RFS proficiency level of four-point one (4.1) compared to three-point zero three (3.03) achieved by control students.
- **In fall 2019, a much higher percentage of treatment students [eighty-six (86) percent or 191/223] than control students [thirty-two (32) percent or 43/134] will begin Grade 1 interacting with the text in RCT School A where the ELI program has been in place for two (2) years.** This is important because research has shown that students that begin Grade 1 at RFS 4 or higher are more likely to achieve Grade 1 EOY reading proficiency.

Recommendation to Approve Agreement
FY20-149 – Tutormate and Teachermate Supplemental Literacy Programs
December 10, 2019 Board Agenda
Page 4

- On the IFL EOY Oral Reading Fluency (ORF) assessment, **fifty-four (54) percent (108/219) of treatment students achieved grade level proficiency as compared to only twenty-eight (28) percent (87/308) of control students.**
- **A greater percentage of treatment students [twenty-six (26) percent or 60/203] achieved Level E or higher on the Benchmark Assessment System as compared to control students [twenty-one (21) percent or 65/294].**

Whole School Impact Study Involving Kindergartner and Grade 1 Students:

- The two (2) years of data from School A show that **seventy-eight (78) percent of Grade 1 students (38/49) that started the ELI program at the beginning of kindergarten met EOY ORF proficiency.** In comparison, the overall Grade 1 ORF proficiency rate was **sixty-eight (68) percent.**
- In School A, **seventy-eight (78) percent (7/9) of English-as-a-Second-Language Learners** that received ELI support starting at the beginning of kindergarten **reached ORF proficiency by the end of Grade 1.**
- Since **ELI support began in School A, the Grade 1 EOY proficiency rate on the Benchmark Assessment System has increased by twenty-six (26) percent;** from fifty-two (52) percent in 2016 to seventy-eight (78) percent in 2018.
- The added support of **the ELI program in School A improved reading outcomes of Grade 1 students by six (6) percent in 2017 and ten (10) percent in 2018.**
- Data on the impact of the ELI's **in all five (5) schools** in which kindergarten students participated in the whole school impact study revealed that **a sizeable percentage of kindergarteners finished the year reading at stage four (4) or higher.** The trend observed in School A suggests that **even higher percentages of these students will reach reading proficiency by the end of Grade 1.**

Teacher Perspectives:

- Six (6) teachers responded to an end-of-year survey of their views and experiences of the ELI program. **All teachers, one hundred (100) percent, believed the ELI support made a positive impact on students' reading performance.**
- **Every teacher one hundred (100) percent felt strongly that the ELI provided effective and helpful support to students,** commenting on particular attributes of the ELI they found to be beneficial (boosting students' self-esteem; encouraging students to take ownership of their reading skills; expressing a caring attitude toward students).
- **Teachers one hundred (100) percent reported being comfortable with the logistics of working with the ELI tutor.** They reported that whether the ELI worked with students in the classroom or in another space, they did not find the push-in or pull-out disruptive to classroom routines.
- **Asked if they would recommend the ELI program to fellow educators, one hundred (100) percent of teachers said they would.** The reasons they gave included the positive impact of the program on students' learning and subsequently on their self-esteem, and that students had fun while learning.

The longitudinal study will continue to follow the children from Kindergarten to Third Grade with final results anticipated in the summer of 2022.

Recommendation to Approve Agreement
FY20-149 – Tutormate and Teachermate Supplemental Literacy Programs
December 10, 2019 Board Agenda
Page 5

Procurement Method
Responsible: PWS

According to Purchasing Policy 3320, Part 2, H: “The requirement of requesting competitive solicitations from three (3) or more sources is hereby waived as authorized by chapter 6A-1.012 (F.A.C.) State Board of Education Administrative rules for the purchase of educational services and any type of copyrighted materials.”

Financial Impact
Responsible: PWS and ELLA

The requested spending authority for the eighteen (18) month agreement will be \$300,000. Funding will be made available through the Title I Grant.

Activity	Amount
2019-2020 TutorMate District Partnership Fee	\$ 132,000
TeacherMate: Endeavor Primary Learning Center TeacherMate ELI Model at 50% (5 classrooms at \$6,000; 5 classrooms at \$3,000)	\$ 45,000
TeacherMate: Walker Elementary - TeacherMate ELI Model at 50% (7 classrooms at \$3,000)	\$ 21,000
TeacherMate: Park Ridge Elementary - TeacherMate ELI Model (5 classrooms at \$6,000)	\$ 30,000
TeacherMate: Flamingo Elementary - TeacherMate ELI Model (5 classrooms at \$6,000)	\$ 30,000
TeacherMate: Thurgood Marshall Elementary - TeacherMate ELI Model (3 classrooms at \$6,000)	\$ 18,000
TeacherMate: Sunland Park Academy - TeacherMate ELI Model (4 classrooms at \$6,000)	\$ 24,000
TOTAL	\$ 300,000

The financial impact amount represents an estimated contract value; however, the amount authorized will not exceed the estimated contract award amount.